U.S. Department of Education
Office of Vocational and Adult Education
Division of Academic and Technical Education

SPAC
State Perkins Accountability Congress
Design Team

State *Perkins* Accountability Congress
Design Team Meeting 6

August 9–10, 2012

Agenda

- Logistics
- Expected meeting outcomes
- DATE overview
- Employment and earnings indicators
- Graduation rate/completion and enrollment in postsecondary indicators
- Progress indicators

Expected Meeting Outcomes

The Design Team will:

- Develop final working draft definition(s) of CTE student populations
- Develop final working draft measures for the core indicators
- Develop a list of potential progress indicators

Principles for Team Dialogue

- Share time and participate equally
- Contribute concisely and stay on topic
- Welcome and respect all opinions
- Listen for meaning
- Build on others' ideas; avoid "but" or "no" responses
- Air concerns during the meeting, not after
- Support the team outside the meeting
- Assign appropriate items to the "parking lot"

Guiding Ideas

We want measures of the core indicators that:

1. Focus on student success
2. Can be acted upon at the local, state, or federal level
3. Are of high quality and efficient in collection and use
4. Are measurable over time
5. Are simple and easily understood
6. Are aligned among related programs and educational sectors
7. Avoid unintended consequences

Engaging in the Dialogue

- SPAC Website: http://cte.ed.gov/spac
- House materials and support dialogue
  - Document storage
  - Meeting recordings
  - Forum
  - Resources
- All interested stakeholders invited to visit the website, download materials, and engage in the online discussions

DATE Welcome and Overview

Johan Uvin, Deputy Assistant Secretary
Office of Vocational and Adult Education (OVAE)
U.S. Department of Education
Johan.Uvin@ed.gov

Sharon Miller, Director
Division of Academic and Technical Education (DATE)
Office of Vocational and Adult Education (OVAE)
sharon.miller@ed.gov

John Haigh, Chief
Accountability and Performance Branch, DATE
Office of Vocational and Adult Education (OVAE)
John.Haigh@ed.gov

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Vocational and Adult Education
Division of Academic and Technical Education

SPAC
State Perkins Accountability Congress
Design Team

Employment and Earnings Indicators

Employment Rate

Wages and Earnings

Common Education Data Standards Project: Workforce

- Along with CTE and AE, workforce is being built into Version 3 of CEDS
- This work is considered “preliminary”—additional details in subsequent versions
- Each group has a state-level working group of ~ 10 participants; the WF WG includes education interests, workforce program interests, and data “operators”
- A stakeholders' group reviews and comments on the efforts of working groups
- Iterative process—telephonic, in-person, and endless e-mails
- Began in May 2012; expected in a proposal/feedback style until Version 3 roll out in January of 2013

CEDS Project: Workforce

- Working group has recommended two parts of "workforce"
  - one focusing on employment and earnings, and
  - one dealing with workforce programs and services
- Discussions mostly focus on employment and earnings
- Discussions are at a very basic data element level—interests in metrics and studies are considered uses
- Starting place: What data are available and in use at the current time in the states

CEDS Project: Employment & Earnings—Proposed Data Elements I

SPAC Design Team

Element Name	*Definition*	*Option Set*	*Domain*	*Entity*
Employed While Enrolled	An individual who is a paid employee or works in his or her own business, profession, or farm and at the same time is enrolled in a secondary, postsecondary, or adult education.	1- Yes 2- No 3- Unknown	Employment	K12 Student Postsecondary Student Adult Education Participant
Employed After Exit	An individual who is a paid employee or works in his or her own business, profession, or farm after exiting secondary, postsecondary, or adult education.	01 - Yes 02 - No 03 - Unknown	Employment	Former K12 Student Former PS Student Former AE Participant
Earnings	The quarterly amount paid to individuals found employed.	$ 000,000.00	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Participant Former Students

CEDS Project: Employment & Earnings—Proposed Data Elements II

SPAC Design Team

Element Name	*Definition*	*Option Set*	*Domain*	*Entity*
Industry (ies) of Employment	The North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) code associated with each individual's employment. Include the reported earnings amount for each NAICS code.	XXXXXX $ 000,000.00	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Participant Former Students
Location of Employment	The state in which a student is found employed.	Two digit, alphabetic, state designation	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Student Former Students
Multiple Jobs	The number of jobs held by a student .	0 (Not Found) 1 2 - 5 >6	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Participant Former Students

CEDS Project: Employment & Earnings—Proposed Data Elements III

SPAC Design Team

Element Name	*Definition*	*Option Set*	*Domain*	*Entity*
Reference Quarter Start Date	The year, month, and day of the starting date for the reference quarter.	YY MM DD	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Participant Former Student
Reference Quarter End Date	The year, month, and day of the ending date for the reference quarter.	YY MM DD	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Participant Former Student
Employment and Earnings Administrative Data Source	Administrative data source of information used to collect employment and earnings-related data.	1- State UI Wage Records 2- Wage Record Interchange System (WRIS II) 3- Federal Employment Data Exchange System (FEDES) 4- Other	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Participant Former Student
Other Data Source	Other data source used to collect employment and earnings-related data.	1. Student follow-up survey 2. Employer Survey 3. Case Management Information	Employment	K12 Student PS Student AE Participant Former Student

Straw Man Measure

A post graduation/attainment "success measure"

$$\frac{\textit{Students Employed/not reenrolled + Students reenrolled/ not employed}}{\textit{Appropriate Secondary or Postsecondary Population}}$$

Denominator

Secondary: Students who

- completed at least 50 percent of a state-approved career preparation program by the end of the reporting year and
- received a high school diploma or equivalent in the reporting year

Postsecondary: Students who

- earned at least 12 cumulative credits (or the equivalent) in a state-approved career preparation program or completed a state-approved career preparation program of fewer than 12 credits (or the equivalent) by the end of the reporting year and
- earned a degree, certificate, or employer credential in the reporting year or following reporting year

Numerator

Secondary: Students in the denominator who were found employed but not reenrolled plus those reenrolled but not employed.

Postsecondary: Students in the denominator who were found employed but not reenrolled plus those reenrolled but not employed.

Points of Agreement

Follow-up Strategy

- States collect employment data through administrative record matches using student information systems, State UI Wage Reports, the Wage Record Interchange System, and the Federal Employment Data Exchange System
- States collect reenrollment data through their SLDS postsecondary linkages and the NSC

Issues for Consideration

Denominators

- Secondary—HS graduates who met the threshold
- Postsecondary—credential earners who met the threshold

Numerators

- Employed—Any administrative record hit or hits where reported earnings > 0
- Reenrolled—higher level? Any level? Defined level?
- Proposed "Straw Man" numerators will be different from further enrollment indicators

Approach

- Point in time snap shot or more of a growth measure?
- When to measure or start the continuous process?
- What is good and not so good?

Straw Man Measure

A post graduation/attainment "earnings change measure"

Consideration 1: Median earnings for defined populations at 6 months, 12 months, and 36 months following graduation/attainment (snap shot historical measures)

Consideration 2: Median earnings for serial cohorts of populations at 6 months, 12 months, and 36 months following graduation/attainment (snap shot longitudinal measures)

Denominator

Secondary: Students who

- completed at least 50 percent of a secondary state-approved career preparation program,
- received a high school diploma or equivalent, and
- were not found enrolled in further education

Postsecondary: Students who

- earned at least 12 cumulative credits (or the equivalent) in a state-approved career preparation program or completed a state-approved career preparation program of fewer than 12 credits (or the equivalent) by the end of the reporting year,
- earned a degree, certificate, or employer certification, and
- were not found enrolled in further education

Numerator

Secondary: Students in the denominator who were found employed with reported wages >0

Postsecondary: Students in the denominator who were found employed with wages >0

Points of Agreement

Follow-up Strategy

- States collect employment data through administrative record matches using student information systems, State UI Wage Reports, the Wage Record Interchange System, and the Federal Employment Data Exchange System
- States collect reenrollment data through their SLDS postsecondary linkages and the NSC

Issues for Consideration

Numerators

- Employed populations with reported earnings > 0
- Trim rules: ridiculously low or impossibly high; common guidance for states.
- Averages, medians, distribution in range “buckets”

Approach

- *Bucket*: Earnings arrayed in select ranges; historical or longitudinal show changing distributions
- *Relative*: Earnings at point 1 relative to earnings at subsequent points reported annually, expressed as a ratio, some form of derived index
- *Absolute*: Numerical or percent change between point 1 and subsequent points

Issues for Consideration (cont.)

Timing

- Sequencing of collections and reporting
- Lag time

General

- Public Clarity
- Good and Bad: Deriving standards empirically

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Vocational and Adult Education
Division of Academic and Technical Education

SPAC
State Perkins Accountability Congress
Design Team

Secondary Indicators

Secondary Graduation Rate

Rate of Secondary Enrollment in Postsecondary Education

Secondary Graduation Rate

Percentage of accountably enrolled students who graduated according to the state's computation of its graduation rate as described in Section 1111(b)(2)(C)(vi) of the *ESEA*

Population

Students who completed at least 50 percent of a state-approved career preparation program by the end of the reporting year

and

were included in the state's computation of its *ESEA* graduation rate in the reporting year

Points of Agreement

Population

- *ESEA* 4-year cohort who met the participation threshold

Graduation

- Award of standard high school diploma as defined in *ESEA*

Method

- Administrative record matches using ESEA data reported to ED*Facts*

Alignment with other initiatives

- Aligned with *ESEA* and *Perkins IV* reporting requirements

Rate of Secondary Enrollment in Postsecondary Education

Percentage of accountably enrolled high school graduates who enroll in postsecondary education in the following reporting year

Population

Students who completed at least 50 percent of a state-approved career preparation program by the end of the reporting year

and

received a high school diploma or equivalent in the reporting year

Points of Agreement

Population

- High school graduates who met participation threshold

Completion

- Standard high school diploma, GED, and equivalent credentials

Method

- Administrative record matches for in-state postsecondary
- NSC for out-of-state enrollments

Assessing enrollment in postsecondary education

- U.S. postsecondary institutions offering education or advanced training

Issues for Consideration

Inclusion/exclusion of students

- CTE program completers only or all students who meet the threshold?
- Students in apprenticeship programs?

Reporting timeline

- Consistency with postsecondary?
- Entire following reporting year or second quarter after end of reporting year?
- Delay/lag acceptable?

Method

- Administrative record matches for in-state postsecondary using SLDS
- NSC for out-of-state enrollments

Assessing enrollment in postsecondary education

- U.S. postsecondary institutions offering education or advanced training

Secondary Threshold

Students who completed at least 50 percent of a state-approved career preparation program by the end of the reporting year

Points of Agreement

Threshold for participation

- Based on percentage of state-approved career preparation program completed
- Complete at least 50 percent of program

Content

- Apply only technical coursework toward threshold

Timing

- Align reporting year with state-defined *ESEA* reporting year
- Suggest aligning CAR data submission with *ESEA* reporting schedule

Career preparation program

- Programs of study connecting secondary education with apprentice and/or postsecondary education or training leading to a degree, certificate, or employer certification tied to a high skill and/or high wage and/or high demand occupation

Issues for Consideration

Inclusion/exclusion of programs

- Secondary programs that do not require apprenticeship and/or postsecondary education or training?
- Minimum course work?
- Related CTE programs that are not federally funded?

High demand

- Specify a source for high demand occupations?

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Vocational and Adult Education
Division of Academic and Technical Education

SPAC
State Perkins Accountability Congress
Design Team

Postsecondary Indicators

Rate of Postsecondary Award Attainment

Rate of Further Enrollment in Postsecondary Education

Rate of Postsecondary Award Attainment

Percentage of accountably enrolled students who were not enrolled in a postsecondary institution the following reporting year and who received a degree, certificate, or employer credential in the reporting year or following reporting year

Population

Students who earned at least 12 cumulative credits (or the equivalent) in a state-approved career preparation program or completed a state-approved career preparation program of fewer than 12 credits (or the equivalent) by the end of the reporting year

and

were not enrolled in a postsecondary institution the following reporting year

Points of Agreement

Population

- Not enrolled in a U.S. postsecondary institution the following reporting year

Completion

- Degrees and certificates awarded by postsecondary institutions
- State- or nationally recognized employer certifications
  - identified by the state as high skill/high wage,
  - awarded by a third party,
  - administered by a proctored testing authority or organization, and
  - on which the student receives a passing score

Method

- Administrative record matches for in-state postsecondary
- NSC for out-of-state enrollments

Assessing enrollment in postsecondary education

- U.S. postsecondary institutions offering education or advanced training

Issues for Consideration

Inclusion/exclusion of students

- Students who continue in postsecondary the following reporting year?
- Students eligible to receive a degree or certificate but who did not actually receive it?

Reporting timeline

- Attainment in the current reporting year and the full following reporting year?

Completion

- Receipt of more than one certificate?
- Include noncredit postsecondary certificates?
- Changes to list of industry-validated certifications?

Further Enrollment in Postsecondary Education

Percentage of accountably enrolled students who did not receive a degree, certificate, or employer credential in the reporting year or the following reporting year and who enrolled in postsecondary education in the following reporting year

Population

Students who earned at least 12 cumulative credits (or the equivalent) in a state-approved career preparation program or completed a state-approved career preparation program of fewer than 12 credits (or the equivalent) by the end of the reporting year

and

did not receive a degree, certificate, or employer certification in the reporting year or the following reporting year

Points of Agreement

Population

- Did not receive a degree, certificate, or credential in the reporting year or following reporting year

Method

- Administrative record matches for in-state postsecondary
- NSC for out-of-state enrollments

Assessing enrollment in postsecondary education

- U.S. postsecondary institutions offering education or advanced training

Issues for Consideration

Inclusion/exclusion of students

- Students who receive a certificate but remain in postsecondary education to pursue a degree?

Reporting timeline

- Consistency with secondary?
- Entire following reporting year or second quarter after end of reporting year?
- Ongoing?

Postsecondary Threshold

Students who earned at least 12 cumulative credits (or the equivalent) in a state-approved career preparation program

or

completed a state-approved career preparation program of fewer than 12 credits (or the equivalent) by the end of the reporting year

Points of Agreement

Credits

- At least 12 cumulative credits or equivalent if program >=12 credits
- Complete programs of <12 credits
- Suggest that use of equivalences be supported by guidance

Time to earn credits

- Could be a specific maximum on years to look back

Issues for Consideration

Inclusion of general education courses

- Technical only or technical and general education coursework?

Current enrollment

- Should students have completed any CTE credits in the reporting year to be included?

Time to credits

- Maximum number of years to look for cumulative credits?

Issues for Consideration (cont.)

Developmental education

- Include credits for developmental education?

Credit awarded in high school

- Students still in high school who have earned 12 or more college credits
- Students who earned 12 college credits while in high school and who are entering postsecondary education in the same POS
- Students who earned 12 college credits while in high school and who are entering postsecondary education in a different POS
- Students who earned 12 college credits while in high school and who are entering postsecondary education but who are not in a POS (i.e., not enrolled in CTE)

U.S. Department of Education
Office of Vocational and Adult Education
Division of Academic and Technical Education

SPAC
State Perkins Accountability Congress
Design Team

Progress/Additional Indicators

Potential Progress/Additional Indicators

Suggested to-date:

- **Secondary**
  - Technical skill attainment

- **Postsecondary**
  - Time to degree
  - Stackable credentials